

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS  
CORPORATION,

Plaintiff,

v.

DIANA ESPINOSA, *et al.*,

Defendants.

No. 21-cv-1479 (DLF)

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that all Defendants hereby appeal to the United States Court of Appeals for the D.C. Circuit from this Court's Order, ECF No. 31, and Memorandum Opinion, ECF No. 32, dated November 5, 2021, granting in part and denying in part Plaintiff's motion for summary judgment, ECF No. 19, and denying Defendants' motion for summary judgment, ECF No. 13.

Dated: December 28, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

BRIAN D. NETTER  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

MICHELLE R. BENNETT  
Assistant Branch Director

*/s/ Jody D. Lowenstein*  
JODY D. LOWENSTEIN  
Mont. Bar No. 55816869  
KATE TALMOR  
Trial Attorneys  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
1100 L Street NW  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Phone: (202) 598-9280  
Email: jody.d.lowenstein@usdoj.gov

*Attorneys for Defendants*

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

UNITED THERAPEUTICS  
CORPORATION,

Plaintiff,

v.

DIANA ESPINOSA, *et al.*,

Defendants.

No. 21-cv-1686 (DLF)

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that all Defendants hereby appeal to the United States Court of Appeals for the D.C. Circuit from this Court's Order, ECF No. 31, and Memorandum Opinion, ECF No. 32, dated November 5, 2021, granting in part and denying in part Plaintiff's motion for summary judgment, ECF No. 14, and denying Defendants' motion for summary judgment, ECF No. 16.

Dated: December 28, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

BRIAN D. NETTER  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

MICHELLE R. BENNETT  
Assistant Branch Director

*/s/ Jody D. Lowenstein*  
JODY D. LOWENSTEIN  
Mont. Bar No. 55816869  
KATE TALMOR  
Trial Attorneys  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
1100 L Street NW  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Phone: (202) 598-9280  
Email: jody.d.lowenstein@usdoj.gov

*Attorneys for Defendants*